



**UNIVERSITY OF KONSTANZ**  
**Research Group Sociology of Knowledge**

**SIXTH FRAMEWORK PROGRAMME OF THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION**  
**PRIORITY 7, FP6-2004-CITIZENS-5**



**SPECIFIC TARGETED RESEARCH PROJECT:**

**Crime as a Cultural Problem. The Relevance of Perceptions of Corruption to Crime Prevention. A Comparative Cultural Study in the EU-Accession States Bulgaria and Romania, the EU-Candidate States Turkey and Croatia and the EU-States Germany, Greece and United Kingdom**

**Protocol of the workshop of the project consortium at Galatasaray University,  
Istanbul (2-3 June 2006)**

Presentations of the first project research phase. They focussed on

- a) the process of generating material,
- b) the choice of the case studies to be examined,
- c) the achieved outcomes and findings to date, but also the problems with generating and evaluating the material and
- d) interim conclusions.

Presentations were delivered by the following consortium members: Centre for Liberal Strategies (Bulgaria), Research Institute for Quality of Life (Romania), Galatasaray University (Turkey), University of Zagreb (Croatia), National School of Public Administration and Local Government, Panteion University (Greece), South East European Studies at Oxford (United Kingdom), Universität Tübingen, Universität Konstanz (Germany).

### **1. Centre for Liberal Strategies (Presentation carried out by **Rashko Dorosiev, M. A.**)**

The initial generation of material has targeted

- Documents on the two particular cases - media materials, NGO analysis, verdicts, parties leaders' statements, and
- General documents and writings on corruption or corruption related topics – NGO analysis, statements and codes of conduct of business associations. The research work of the Bulgarian team will concentrate on two corruption cases:

Case Study 1: Privatization of Bulgartabac Holding (leading tobacco company in SEE, state-owned and managed, tobacco buying, processing and leaf trade, manufacturing and export of cigarettes)

Case Study 2: Anonymous donation to the Union of Democratic Force party's foundation.

The analytical description of the cases was followed by a presentation of a document evaluation with the atlas-ti computer program. The data concerning these corruption cases relate to

- Documents on the two particular cases - media materials, NGO analysis, verdicts, parties leaders' statements
- General documents and writings on corruption or corruption related topics – NGO analysis, statements and codes of conduct of business associations.

## **2. University of Zagreb** (Presentation carried out by **Professor Krešimir Kufrin**)

The Croatian team has at first studied examples of research using the theoretical framework of Grounded Theory. At the same time it succeeded in coming to grips with certain aspects of the atlas-ti computer program. This both theoretical and computer related activities were supplemented by the selection of the research assistants: The evaluation work will be carried out by two research/coding teams (two persons each). In March it held two sessions, the first on the Grounded Theory outline and examples of research, the second on working with atlas-ti. There followed a number of meetings on selecting materials to be coded, resolving problems and doubts regarding coding, unifying the work of the two research teams and finally resolving problems with the computer program and the (un)availability of material.

According to the criteria of **a)** higher/lower level corruption and **b)** the availability of materials from various target groups two case studies have been selected:

Case Study 1: The financing of the last presidential campaign (January 2005), and

Case Study 2: Corruption in old people's homes in the city of Zagreb.

The Croatian research team has come up with certain problems regarding the generation of material that have successfully been dealt with through the use of proxy material for the problematic target groups. Other problems to come to grips with relate to the declarative character of the documents and the difficulties with generalization and theory building.

## **3. Research Institute for Quality of Life** (Presentation carried out by **Dr Iuliana Precupețu**)

*Approach to case studies:* In regard to privatisation and high level corruption, two case studies were chosen in order to highlight the various facets of corruption in Romania.

Case Study 1: 'Rompetrol' case: Privatisation of a big oil company with huge debts to the state in total amount of 603 million dollars. A prominent member of the Liberal party holds the majority of stocks. The debts of the company were transformed by governmental ordinance in bonds. The case is in progress.

Case Study 2: The case regarding the National Lottery and the former vice-prime minister that refers mainly to buying and selling state assets without paying taxes. This case allows illustrating overlapping of interests, mechanisms of corruption like using micro-firms that do not pay taxes to state for transactions, and various networks.

In regard to party funding, one case is analysed, that of Humanistic party referring to donations higher than allowed by law in the electoral campaign of 2004. This was revealed by the report of Court of Accounts and is currently being followed by the Court of Appeal in Bucharest.

Materials from all six target groups have been collected. The difficulty consists in gathering documents that refer to the case studies across the target groups. Consequently, documents will cover as much as possible the groups referring to case studies while they will be complemented with other materials (verdicts for other corruption cases in case of justice and in case of police, policy materials and anticorruption strategies).

Part of the material collected have been analysed by Atlas ti.

#### **4. South East European Studies at Oxford (Presentation carried out by Dr Sappho Xenakis)**

The corruption cases to be examined are the following:

Case Study 1: Party Financing: 2006 ‘Cash for Peerages’ scandal. This case is useful because of its proximity for recent legal developments to the definition and restrictions concerning corruption in the UK.

Case Study 2: The use of bribery to further British commercial interests abroad: Balfour Beatty and the Pergau Dam Affair, 1994. This case is of particular pertinence to the overall research project UK because it addresses the issue of the degree to which the UK has been committed to anti-corruption policies at home as well as abroad (namely in EU candidate states).

The preliminary conclusions arrived at can be summarised as follows:

- There was an interesting preliminary finding from the NGO and politicians focus groups in the first case study regarding the perceived acceptability of a certain degree of patronage in politics and conceptions about where the ideal limits to it were to be drawn.
- The under-use of the word ‘corruption’ in documents collected also appeared relevant.
- There were evident concerns raised in both case studies about money/business interests intermeshing with politicians and influencing policy to the detriment of the public good.
- There was some overlap of codes between the two cases. This appears to be a positive finding for the study and hopefully will aid to the construction of a network of logic to be

derived from the codes that will help to clarify the context of perspectives on corruption in the UK.

There also arises a number of pertinent questions: a) How can mundane conclusions be avoided? b) How can stable conclusions about perceptions on corruption be reached for a situation in flux? c) Software problems: 1. losing documents, 2. incompatibility with Word documents, 3. incompatibility of Atlas-ti line references to original documents.

## **5. National School of Public Administration and Local Government, Panteion University** (Presentation carried out by **Professor Effi Lambropoulou**)

Since April the Greek team has concentrated on searching the specific case studies, which would cover the relevant target groups and on collecting data and documents.

Case Study 1: Party financing. The data generated relate to **a)** politics (parliamentary debates on party financing and in particular, Law 3023/2002, relevant legislation, Parliamentary proceedings, Electoral programs of ND and PASOK [*New Democracy, Pan-Hellenic Socialistic Movement*]), **b)** the media (Articles of three high circulation daily newspapers, the news transcripts on abuse of power, bribery, breach of trust and duty from NET/T.V., Search in SKAI radio Archive), **c)** the legal system (Findings of investigation of General Public Prosecutor – although access was denied since we do not have legitimate interest –, court decisions on cases of abuse of power, bribery, breach of trust and duty, which were published in law journals), and **d)** the economy (Federation of Greek Industry [SEV]).

Case Study 2: illegal naturalizations. The data generated relate to **a)**, politics (parliamentary proceedings (26.5.2000) concerning a question on the issue by a Member of the Parliament, parliamentary proceedings, investigation committee instituted by ND concerning the research case and the elections of 9.4.2000), **b)** the police (Police Division of Serres-Prefecture/General Police Division of Central, Macedonia, [case uncovered], the Head of the Police department [who gave a Press Conference but denied any hard or electronic copy – we are looking for access only via the local TV archive]), **c)** the media (articles of three high circulation daily newspapers, search in SKAI radio Archive), **d)** the legal system (law 2910/2001, concerning naturalization, findings of investigation of General Public Prosecutor) and **e)** the civil society (Publications pertinent to the issue and not the special case from *Apodimos, Hellenic Front* and *Network 21* [NGOs]).

The next step is to decide on the specific documents to be used for data analysis with Atlas-ti. The team has already started working with it, becoming acquainted with the procedure. The main qualitative analysis should be completed by the end of July.

## **6. Galatasaray University (Presentation carried out by Esat Bozyigit, M. A.)**

Two corruption cases were selected for examination:

Case Study 1: Corruption in party financing. Involved is the Welfare Party (*Refah Partisi*, RP), whose predecessors (*Milli Nizam Partisi*, National Order Party, MNP), and *Milli Selamet Partisi*, National Salvation Party, MSP), had been periodically banned since 25 years by the Constitutional Court for threatening the “laic principle” of the Republic, and had been re-established several times under different names and re-banned. As the WP was banned in January 1998, the Constitutional Court decided that it would have to refund the state subsidies it had received. However, the funds disappeared and there was no reimbursement. This leading case labelled as the “Mercümek-case” (named after the financial consultant who handled the party’s assets).

Case Study 2: In December 2003 the new Parliament voted overwhelmingly to launch investigations into alleged wrongdoing by former Prime Minister Mesut Yılmaz and five other former ministers – currently being tried, separately or in pairs, before the Supreme Court (the name under which Turkey's highest tribunal, the Constitutional Court, sits when judging senior government officials). The trials came after extensive parliamentary investigations into allegations of widespread fraud in tenders, bankruptcies, banking reforms and power projects that cost Turkey billions of dollars over the past decade.

The material of the international and national anti-corruption agencies or NGO’s and most of the data related with the envisaged case-studies (parliamentary minutes and investigation reports, verdicts, media reporting and commentaries, publications of different socio-economic associations, etc.) has already been gathered. Since there is no “ombudsman’s office” in Turkey yet, the Turkish team is going to examine the investigation reports of the parliament and ministerial boards (of the Prime Ministry, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Justice), as well as the related reports of the audit bodies (Turkish Court of Accounts, High Audit Board under the Prime Minister’s Department and the State Audit Board under the Presidency).

## **7. University of Konstanz / University of Tübingen (Presentations carried out by Dr Angelos Giannakopoulos and Dr Dr Konstadinos Maras)**

The German team has focussed on corruption cases pertaining to party financing and bribery.

Case Study 1: The ‘Black Accounts’-affair of the CDU (Christ Democratic Party). Under Helmut Kohl the CDU raised millions of marks in illegal donations from 1982 to 1998. Kohl had access to secret accounts from which he allocated large sums of money to individual representatives and party bodies, circumventing the responsible party structures and prevailing laws, albeit securing in this way his control over the party machine.

Case Study 2: The donations-affair of the SPD (Social Democratic Party) in the federal state of NRW (Northern Rhenania-Westphalia). In 2002 leading Social Democrats officials in Cologne were arrested in connection with an alleged 21 Million DM bribery scheme involving the construction of a garbage incinerator.

The data to these cases and relevant material to other corruption affairs have been generated. They consists in: **a)** protocols of parliamentary debates of the ‘Bundestag’ on the ‘Black Accounts’-affair of the CDU party, **b)** protocols of parliamentary debates of the ‘Landtag’ of the federal state of NRW (Northern Rhenania-Westphalia) on the Donations-affair of the SPD party [Background documents: Reports of the parliamentary investigation committees], **c)** Verdict of the ‘Landgericht Köln’ (Court of the federal state of NRW, Cologne) on the Donations-affair of the SPD party, **d)** Analysis of documents published by ‘Transparency International’, Germany, **e)** Press analyses on the ‘Black Accounts’-affair of the CDU party and Donations-affair of the SPD party from the newspapers ‘Frankfurter Allgemeine’ and ‘Süddeutsche Zeitung’ (200 articles) – Recordings of the TV talk-shows ‘Sabine Christiansen’ (ARD channel) and ‘hart aber fair’ (WDR channel) on the same corruption cases, **f)** Public statements and statements of formal obligation by the DGB (German Trade Union Association) and BDI (German Industry Association).

### **Final Discussion**

In the final discussion the general agreement was made that theoretical or methodological discussions are not subject of an empirical research project and that only pragmatic and technical problems referring to grounded theory and Atlas-ti are of crucial interest. Questions like

those, if grounded theory is a scientific approach or not do not answer any problem of the consortium as defined in the contract with the European Commission. Criteria for the evaluation of the research groups' data generation and empirical findings are those in the appendix. Expected are analytical and not only descriptive codings, i.e. not lists of manifest key-concepts but a reconstruction of the relations between key-concepts (and key-passages) and their social meaning.